

**Final document to be edited for publication. Not for citation**

# **Health Impacts of Traditional Fuel Use in Guatemala**

---

**June 2003**

Joint UNDP/World Bank Energy Sector Management Assistance Programme  
(ESMAP)



## Contents

<b>Acknowledgements.....</b>	<b>vii</b>
<b>Abbreviations and Acronyms.....</b>	<b>ix</b>
<b>Units of Measure.....</b>	<b>x</b>
<b>Glossary of Terms.....</b>	<b>xi</b>
<b>Executive Summary.....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>1. Introduction.....</b>	<b>9</b>
Nature of the problem in Guatemala.....	11
Context for this report.....	16
Individual studies.....	17
Structure of the Report.....	18
<b>2. Indoor Air Pollution and Health: Evidence from DHS and LSMS Surveys.....</b>	<b>19</b>
The Survey Samples.....	19
The DHS Sample.....	20
The LSMS Sample.....	21
Socioeconomic Profile.....	22
Household Energy Use and IAP Factors.....	24
Infant Respiratory Illness Analysis and the National Surveys .....	28
Evidence from The DHS Study.....	28
Evidence from The LSMS Study.....	30
Conclusion.....	31
<b>3. Estimating Health Impacts.....</b>	<b>33</b>
Scope of the Study.....	33
Indoor Air Pollution in the Guatemalan Highlands .....	35
Estimation of Health Impacts of Indoor Air Pollution.....	45
Calculation of ALRI associated with IAP in Guatemala .....	46
Cases of Excess Morbidity .....	48
Cases of Excess Mortality.....	48
Conclusions.....	51

<b>4. The Evolution of Improved Stoves in Guatemala.....</b>	<b>53</b>
Development of Improved Stoves in Guatemala.....	54
Period of Technological Innovation, 1976–80.....	55
The Lorena Stove As a Product of the Period.....	57
Studies on and Decline of Improved Stoves, 1986–93.....	58
Promotion Commercial Models Of Improved Stoves, 1993-2001.....	58
Beginning Of The Period Of Commercial Distribution. 2001 And Onward.....	60
Description of Research and Main Issues.....	61
Main Issues Examined in Stove Programs.....	61
Design of the Study.....	62
Three Case Studies of Improved Stove Programs.....	63
The Tezulutlán project: Integrating Stoves with Rural Development.....	63
The INTERVIDA Program: Focus on Children, Families and Poverty.....	65
The FIS Program: Successful Government Program with Limited Flexibility....	67
Comparative Assessment of the Case Studies.....	69
Subsidies and Commercialization of the Stove Program.....	69
Stove Design Issues and After Sales Maintenance.....	70
The Users Perception of Improved Stoves.....	72
Interaction Between Stove Users, Builders, and Designers.....	74
Recommendations and Lessons.....	76
Role of subsidies.....	77
Role of the market.....	77
Greater Interaction Between Programs: Stove Users, Designers, and .....	
Manufacturers.....	78
Institutional Roles and Participants for Promoting Improved Stoves.....	78
Technical Unit to Certify Stoves for Subsidy Approval.....	79
Conclusion.....	80
<b>5. Role of LPG.....</b>	<b>83</b>
Fuel Use Patterns.....	84
Cost of LPG Consumption.....	85
Institutional and Regulatory Framework.....	89

Market Structure and Competitiveness.....	90
Commercial Malpractice.....	92
Safety and Cylinder Management.....	92.
Conclusions.....	94
<b>6. Policy Recommendations .....</b>	<b>95</b>
Poverty and Indoor Air Pollution.....	95
Linkage with Millennium Development Goals.....	95
What can be done about indoor air pollution?.....	96
The role of each stakeholder in a solution.....	99
<b>Bibliography.....</b>	<b>105</b>
<b>Annex 1 List of Workshop Participants.....</b>	<b>109</b>
<b>Annex 2. Summary of Good Practices and Problems in Improved Stoves Program.....</b>	<b>123</b>

## **TABLES**

Table 1.1 Five Principal Cause of General Morbidity and mortality in Guatemala Between 1997 and 2000.....	12
Table 1.2 Comparison of Emission from Open fire, Plancha and LPG stove in Guatemala Highlands.....	14
Table 2.1 Sample Distribution – Guatemala 1998-1999 DHS.....	20
Table 2.2 Sample Distribution – Guatemala 2000 LSMS.....	21
Table 2.3 Electricity in Guatemalan Households.....	23
Table 2.4 Distribution of Main or Single Fuels Used for Cooking in Guatemala–DHS....	25
Table 2.5 Summary of All Fuels Used for Cooking by Guatemalan Households–LSMS...26	
Table 2.6 Combination of Fuels and Kitchen Facilities in Guatemalan Homes, LSMS....	27
Table 2.7 Respiratory Symptoms in Children by Fuel and Cooking Space-DHS.....	29
Table 2.8 Respiratory Symptoms in Children by Fuel and Cooking Space-LSMS.....	30
Table 3.1 Percent of Rural Households Using Fuelwood, Conditional on House Characteristics.....	36
Table 3.2 Personal and Daily Average Kitchen Measurements of Particulate Matter in Guatemalan Highlands.....	44
Table 3.3 Adjusted Odds Ratios for ARI and ALRI Estimated with Logistical Model.....	47
Table 3.4 Number of Children under 5 years of age and ALRI incidence rates.....	49

Table 3.5 Excess Cases of ALRI Morbidity and Mortality in the Guatemalan Highlands Associated with Indoor Air Pollution.....	50
Table 4.1 Stages in the Development of Stove Technology.....	56
Table 4.2 Communities Selected for the Study.....	62
Table 4.3 Typical Subsidies in Three Programs Rural Guatemalan 2002.....	70
Table 4.4 Problems with Improve Stove Chimneys in Guatemala 2002.....	71
Table 4.5 The Benefits of Improved Stove in Two Programs Guatemala 2002.....	73
Table 5.1 Household Fuel Use Patterns for Cooking and Heating Percentage of Households in Each Category.....	84
Table 5.2 LPG Availability and Uptake by Household Percentage of Households in Each Category.....	86
Table 5.3 Cylinder Sizes in Guatemala.....	87
Table 5.4 Retail Cost of LPG Cylinder and Stove.....	87
Table 5.5 Mean Monthly Per Capita and Household Expenditures in Quezales.....	88
Table 5.6 Retail Prices of LPG sold in 25 lb. Cylinder.....	89

## FIGURES

Figure 1.1 Energy options with increasing mitigation effectiveness for health impacts of IAP.....	10
Figure 4.1 The Typical; Plancha Stove Promoted by the Social Funds in Guatemala.....	60
Figure 4.2 The Tezulutlán improved stove.....	64
Figure 4.3 Variations of Intervida-Type Stove.....	66
Figure 4.4 Stoves in Rural Households.....	68
Figure 4.5 Firebox Differences between Stoves.....	72
Figure 5.1 Comparison of LPG Prices Exclusive of Taxes.....	91
Figure 5.2 Price of LPG Sold in 25 lb. Cylinder in Guatemala City.....	91

## **Acknowledgments**

This study was undertaken by the Latin America and Caribbean Regional Office of the World Bank in a joint effort between the Energy and Environment Units, with close coordination with the Health Unit, and with support from the joint UNDP/World Bank Energy Sector Management Assistance Programme (ESMAP). The financial assistance of the Governments of the Netherlands and Germany is gratefully acknowledged.

The report responds to a request received from the Minister of Energy and Mines (MEM) in Guatemala to better understand the implications of indoor air pollution in Guatemala and the corresponding mitigation options. Special gratitude is extended to Vice-Minister Santizo of MEM for his personal interest and leadership in this area, and to Milton Saravia, Environment Unit Coordinator, MEM and direct counterpart for this study.

Particular mention should also be made of the multisectoral participants who attended the two dissemination workshops in Guatemala held in November 2001 and April 2003. These participants represented a wide spectrum of Guatemalan sectors and stakeholders from the government of Guatemala (including representatives of the Ministry of Energy and Mines, Ministry of Health, Ministry of Environment and Natural Resources, and the Social Investment Fund), academia, the private sector and non-governmental organizations. The full list of participants who attended these two workshops is in Annex 1. These participants provided guidance to the Bank team, helping us to “ground” our recommendations in the reality of the Guatemalan context. It is they who are the champions of this cause, as Guatemala moves forward to address these issues that are so closely linked with its development priorities.

This report is based on the work of several consultants, as follows: Jose Eddy Torres (survey analysis); Fundacion Solar (improved stoves) including Ivan Azurdia, Manuel Tay, Danilo Alvarez and Carolina Palma; Rogerio Carneiro de Miranda (improved stoves); William Matthews (LPG); and Alejandra Palma (health impacts).

Finally, the core World Bank team that worked on this study includes Kulsum Ahmed (Task Team Leader), Yewande Awe (Co-Task Team Leader), Douglas Barnes (improved stoves and survey analysis), Katia Nemes (Workshop Coordinator), Masami Kojima (LPG component), and Maureen Cropper (health impacts component). Peer reviewers included Kseniya Lvovsky (Lead Environment Economist) and Marcelo Bortman (Public Health Specialist). Report formatting assistance was provided by Erica Felix. In addition, the team would particularly like to acknowledge the personal support and close involvement of Susan Goldmark (LCR Energy Sector Manager), Dominique Lallement (Manager, ESMAP), Eduardo Somensatto (Guatemala Country Manager), and Helena Ribe (Health Sector Leader for Central America).

The Sector Manager for this activity is Susan Goldmark (LCSFE); the FPSI Sector Leader is Manuel Sevilla (LCC2C); the FPSI Sector Department Director is Danny

Leipziger; the Central America Country Director is Jane Armitage; and the LCR Regional Vice-President is David de Ferranti.



## Abbreviations and Acronyms

<b>ALRI</b>	acute lower respiratory infection
<b>ARI</b>	acute respiratory infection
<b>CI</b>	confidence interval
<b>CO</b>	carbon monoxide
<b>COGUANOR</b>	<i>Comisión Guatemalteca de Normas</i>
<b>COPD</b>	chronic obstructive pulmonary disease
<b>DALY</b>	disability-adjusted life year
<b>DGH</b>	<i>Dirección General de Hidrocarburos</i>
<b>DHS</b>	Demographic Health Survey
<b>ENCOVI</b>	<i>Encuesta Nacional sobre Condiciones de Vida</i>
<b>ENSMI</b>	<i>Encuesta Nacional de Salud Materno Infantil</i>
<b>ESMAP</b>	Energy Sector Management Assistance Programme
<b>FIS</b>	<i>Fondo Inversión Social</i> (Social Investment Fund)
<b>GDP</b>	Gross Domestic Product
<b>HSE</b>	health, safety and environment
<b>IAP</b>	indoor air pollution
<b>LPG</b>	liquefied petroleum gas
<b>LSMS</b>	Living Standard Measurement Survey
<b>MDG</b>	Millennium Development Goal
<b>MEM</b>	<i>Ministerio de Energía y Minas</i>
<b>MSPAS</b>	<i>Ministerio de Salud Pública y Asistencia Social</i>
<b>NGO</b>	non-governmental organization
<b>NW</b>	northwest
<b>PM</b>	particulate matter
<b>PM<sub>10</sub></b>	particles with an aerodynamic diameter less than 10 microns
<b>PM<sub>2.5</sub></b>	particles with an aerodynamic diameter less than 2.5 microns
<b>PM<sub>3.5</sub></b>	particles with an aerodynamic diameter less than 3.5 microns
<b>SW</b>	southwest
<b>TSP</b>	total suspended particles
<b>UNDP</b>	United Nations Development Programme
<b>URI</b>	upper respiratory tract infection
<b>U.S.</b>	United States of America
<b>WHO</b>	World Health Organization

## Units of Measure

<b>g/m<sup>3</sup></b>	grams per cubic meter
<b>lb.</b>	pounds (454 grams)
<b>mg/m<sup>3</sup></b>	milligrams per cubic meter
<b>mm</b>	millimeter
<b>ppm</b>	parts per million
<b>Q.</b>	(Guatemalan) Quetzales
<b>μg/m<sup>3</sup></b>	micrograms per cubic meter
<b>μm</b>	micron (one-thousandth of a millimeter)

